The active collaborators among the police and bureaucracy were rewarded by even post retirement assignments.

A few illustrations are:

1. G. Subharao (IAS, 1965):

The then chief secretary (2002) was given a three-month extension in his post and also appointed chairman of the Gujarat Electricity Regulatory Commission with a fixed tenure for six years from May 2003. Occupying the senior-most position within the state bureaucracy in 2002, Subbarao coerced officials to support the unlawful policies of the Modi government and even instructed officers to 'eliminate' minorities. His position enabled him to enforce instructions to subvert evidence in crucial cases. The Chief Secretary is the bridge and link between the political echelon of the Govt. and the bureaucracy, including the police. Despite the appointment of the Nananvati Shah Commission, the then Chief Secretary, Shri G.Subba Rao, (1965 Batch) did not care to file any Affidavit so far. Reportedly he is appointed as Chairman, Gujarat State Police Complaint Authority post retirement.

2. PC Pande (IPS, 1970)

The former CP, Ahmedabad city, was inducted into the central government by the NDA in March 2004, to the prestigious post of additional director, CBI under the NDA I regime. Pande's appointment to the CBI was challenged by Citizens for Justice and Peace (CJP) in the Supreme Court and he was directed by the apex court not to have anything to do with the Gujarat cases. Pande was then transferred to the post of additional director-general of the

Indo-Tibetan Border Security Force in October 2004. In April 2006 Pande was appointed to the post of DGP, Gujarat, after which a second approach to the Supreme Court by CJP has once again led the court to direct him not to be involved in the investigation of riot related cases. It is relevant to note that Pande's appointments to these influential posts are rewards for his services in facilitating the massacre of nearly 1,000 persons in Ahmedabad city during the 2002 riots, 95 per cent of them Muslim, and for shielding the Hindu perpetrators from arrest during the investigation of riot cases. He did not file a second affidavit under the commission's second term of reference (probing the chief minister's role in the violence) After retirement in 2009, he has been given a lucrative posting of Chairman Gujarat State Police Housing Corporation with an annual budget of Rs 250 crores. Subsequently he joined important position in Advani's Group of company. Accepted a good position in Adani governing body.

3. Dr.P.K.Mishra, IAS (1972)

Principal Secretary to the CM Modi during the critical days. He was instrumental in giving illegal verbal instructions to Govt. functionaries (Sreekumar's Register). He did not file a second affidavit under the commission's second term of reference (probing the chief minister's role in the violence) once the terms of reference had been extended to probe tha CM and cabinet's role. The former principal secretary to the chief minister and chief executive officer, Gujarat State Disaster Management Authority (GSDMA), was later appointed to the important post of additional secretary, ministry of home affairs, Gujarat. He was also sent on several

foreign jaunts in his capacity as chief of the GSDMA. Mishra was rewarded for his services to political masters as dedicated collaborator in the chief minister's anti-minority drive. PK Mishra was posted to the post of principal secretary in the department of agriculture and cooperation of the union ministry of agriculture under the Nationalist Congress Party's Sharad Pawar. On his retirement last year he has been posted as Chairman of the Gujarat Electricity Regulatory Commission with a fixed tenure for six years. He is presently in the Prime Minister's office as Additional Principal Secretary to the Prime Minister.

4. PK Laheri (IAS,

Chief Secretary Gujarat state between the years 2003-2005 who played an active role in the subversion of the criminal justice system that had led to a sever indictment by the Apex Court ("modern day Neros") was also rewarded on his retirement by being appointed to the post of Chairman, Narmada Project. He was cross examined in Open Court by the Supreme Court of India on 18.9.2003. He is reportedly presently a Member of the Somanath Temple Trust.

5. Shri Ashok Narayanan, IAS (1966)

The then additional chief secretary (home) (2002) was given a two-year post-retirement position as Gujarat state vigilance commissioner. This post and privilege was extended for six years. He was selected for this sensitive post despite the fact that his conduct and performance as former additional chief secretary is currently under scrutiny at the Nanavati-Shah Commission. He demonstrated his allegiance to the chief minister by not revealing anything adverse in his

affidavit before the commission and during his cross-examination before the commission in August 2004. Moreover, he did not file a second affidavit under the commission's second term of reference (probing the chief minister's role in the violence). Presently he does not have any assignment.

6 Sudhir Mankad (IAS, 1971)

The Chief Secretary from 2005-2007 he played an active role in the continuing subversion of the criminal justice system and was rewarded by being appointed Chairman and Managing Director of Gujarat International Finance Tec-City (GIFT) where he reportedly continues to be a member.

- 7. Manjula Subramaniam (IAS, 1972?) The Chief Secretary from 2007- 2009 continued to subvert the criminal justice system and was rewarded by being appointed as Chairman State Vigilance Commission. Manjula Subramaniam (IAS 1972): 2009 -2010, She was the Chairman State Vigilance Commission and now has no assignment.
- 8. KC Kapoor (IAS, 1972??)

Principal Secretary Home between 2004-2007 was an active collaborator in subversion of the criminal justice system and for the same has been rewarded by being appointed as State Election Commissioner in 2006 when he retired. Presently he has no assignment

9. AK Bhargava (IPS, 1967)

Appointed DGP, Gujarat, in February 2004, Bhargava was allowed to hold the additional charge of MD, Gujarat State Police Housing Corporation Ltd., controlling an annual budget of Rs 200 crore when he retired in April 2006. As DGP, he readily cooperated with the government in protecting the BJP's political interests in the matter of review of about 2,000 riot related cases, the Pandharwada mass graves case, the harassment of upright officers, compliance with the government's illegal directives, and so on. He too did not any affidavit before the Nanavati Shah Mehta Commission. He reportedly has no assignment presently.

10. **G.C.Raiger**, (IPS 1972)

Then ADGP – Intelligence, during the crucial period of riots viz. from 27th February, 2002 to 9th April, 2002. He attended meetings convened by the CM, the Chief Secretary and Addl. CS. But, there are no notes or records about the proceedings in these meetings, nor there is any minutes issued. Later as ADGP Crime also h had been helpful in covering up the cases of extra judicial killings ("encounters") in favour of the Gujarat police officers. He too did not file any affidavit before the Nanavati Shah Mehta Commission though he was ADGP Intelligence during the most significant period of the violence, under scrutiny by the Commission. In 2009 he was given the post retirement posting appointing him as member of a Judicial Commission inquiring into the illicit liquor tragedy. Presently, no assignment.

11. MK Tandon (IPS, 1976)

The former Joint CP, Ahmedabad city, was transferred to the "lucrative" Surat Range post in May 2002 and later promoted to the post of ADGP, Gandhinagar. In July 2005 Tandon was appointed to the post of ADGP (law & order) at the state police headquarters, a position with statewide jurisdiction. Tandon was rewarded for his services in facilitating the carnages at Gulberg Society, Naroda Patiya and elsewhere in Ahmedabad city where hundreds of Muslims were killed during the riots in 2002. He too did not file a second affidavit under the commission's second term of reference (probing the chief minister's role in the violence). He retired in June 2007, presently no assignment.

12. Deepak Swaroop (IPS, 1976)

The former Range Officer, Vadodara Range (covering the districts of Vadodara Rural, Godhra, Dahod and Narmada), was appointed CP, Vadodara, in February 2005. In charge of an area that witnessed ghastly incidents of violence in 2002, Swaroop is noted for his sustained inaction in the face of marauding mobs. He also narrowly escaped reprimand for concealing facts vis-à-vis investigation into the Best Bakery case by sessions judge, Abhay Thipsay, during the retrial of the case in Mumbai. Later he was posted as Commissioner of Police Surat (prestigious appointment) and currently is ADGP in Charge of 13 armed battalions. Retired in March 2013, presently no assignment.

13. K. Nityanandam (IPS,

):

The former home secretary was promoted to the post of CP, Rajkot city, in February 2005, a

promotion effected by upgrading the post by two levels, from DIG to ADGP. Nityanandam was rewarded for his services as home secretary from 2001 to 2005, in particular for manipulating statistics and fabricating and drafting pro-government reports that were submitted to the NHRC and the courts. Retired in November 2011. Till 2013 he held the post of Managing Director Gujarat Police Housing Corporation, a lucrative post. Presently no assignment..

14. Rakesh Asthana (IPS,):

Although a junior IG, Asthana was appointed to the post of IGP of the important Vadodara Range in April 2003. He was rewarded for zealously pursuing the government's conspiracy theory with regard to the Godhra incident in his capacity as head of the Special Investigation Team probing the Godhra train arson. He was then posted as Commissioner of Police, Vadodara city. He was choice of PMO as appointment first to CBI and then as Director, an appointment that remains under challenge in the Supreme Court (for superseding others)

15. AK Sharma (IPS)

The former SP, Mehsana, was appointed to the post of IGP, Ahmedabad Range, an important jurisdiction, an appointment that was achieved by downgrading the post. In early December 2002, prior to the Gujarat assembly elections, AK Sharma was removed from the post of SP, Mehsana, under instructions from the election commission who believed his presence would not be conducive to the conduct of free and fair elections in the district. He was however

reinstated as SP later that month. Sharma was rewarded for his services during the riots of 2002. It was under Sharma's jurisdiction that Mehsana district witnessed gruesome incidents of mass carnage, including the massacre at Sardarpura. Though a junior DIG, he is posted as DIG Range in charge of Gandhinagar range (Sabarkantha, Mehsana and Gandhinagar districts). He was handpicked choice of PMO to CBI after 2014.

16. Shivanand Jha (IPS,)

The former Addl. CP, Ahmedabad city, was appointed home secretary in February 2005. As Addl. CP, Jha headed the team that assaulted representatives of the media and social activists – including Narmada Bachao Andolan leader, Medha Patkar – at a peace meeting in Ahmedabad in April 2002. He was then transferred to the post of DIG (armed units), Rajkot, an appointment achieved by downgrading the post. Jha was rewarded in view of his services during the 2002 riots and for making no adverse revelations about the government before the Nanavati-Shah Commission. As home secretary, Jha was handling the preparation of reports defending the government in all matters relating to the 2002 riots and subsequent developments, to be presented to the courts and other bodies. The state government got him inducted into the Supreme Court appointed SIT though he was figuring in Zakia Ahsan Jafri's complaint (dated June 8, 2006) and he was removed by an order of April 2010. For all his services rendered he was posted as Range He was then in Charge of Surat (a lucrative posting)

and later promoted as ADGP and posted as Commissioner of Police, Surat City. Still serving. He is posted as Additional DGP Intelligence.

17. Sudhir K. Sinha (IPS,

The former CP, Vadodara city, from June 2003, was appointed CP, Surat city, in February 2005, a post that many consider the most "profitable" one in the Gujarat police. Sinha was rewarded for his services in turning the key prosecution witness in the Best Bakery case, Zahira Shaikh, hostile, an event that occurred during his tenure as CP, Vadodara city. He was later posted as Commissioner of Police, Ahmedabad City and after retirement as Member of State Human Rights Commission. Now no assignment.

18. DG Vanzara (IPS)

Appointed DIG, Anti-Terrorism Squad, in July 2005, Vanzara's appointment was effected by downgrading the post from the level of IGP to DIGP. He was rewarded for 'eliminating' several Muslims in so-called police encounters during his tenure as DCP, Ahmedabad Crime Branch, from May 2002 to July 2005. He was arrested in April 2007 for his alleged involvement in the Sohrabuddin Sheikh encounter case and Ishrat Jahan case. He has enjoyed extra Constitutional powers much beyond his rank due to his close proximity to the chief minister. Now no assignment.

19. SS Khandwawala (IPS, 1973)

Here is an officer who was convicted in a criminal case a Court in 2004 in a case of human rights violations but was promoted to the senior most post of DGP Gujarat in 2009 and thereby given the charge of the entire Gujarat police force, brazenly ensuring compliance from an officer who has been convicted under law. He has been particularly helpful to the state by ensuring that the reopening of 2,000 cases ordered by the Supreme Court in August 2004 was neutralized. This was done through the intimidation of complainants and witnesses. He reportedly utilized police force for making witnesses of riot cases hostile, so hardly 35 cases out of 2,000 odd cases reopened on the Supreme Court orders, were chargesheeted. In August 2010, he was given 3 months' extension in service. Presently he is serving Essar Group of Companies.

20. J Mahapatra (IPS, 1974)

He was ADGP Intelligence from September 2002 and fabricated reports in favour of the state government's position. He played an instrumental role in protecting then Gujarat cabinet minister Ashok Bhatt from prosecution by turning a complaint hostile to an FIR lodged by himself against the former late minister. He was rewarded with promotion by superseding his senior HR Gehlot to the rank of DGP and also given the assignment of Commissioner of Police Ahmedabad city. On his retirement in 2008 he was given the post retirement placement of member in the State Administrative Tribunal, quasi-judicial status. Presently, no assignment.

21. OP Mathur (IPS)

As ADGP Crime, He has also denigrated the Conscience Register of RB Sreekumar. He also played an unholy role in destroying evidence relating to the Sohrabuddin Shaikh encounter case and other such cases against the pro government officials. After retirement at the rank of DGP he was posted as Director/Vice Chancellor Security University Gujarat State. Perhaps this is the only case of a simple post graduate being appointed as Vice Chancellor. He retired in March 2009. After retirement at the rank of DGP he was posted as Director/Vice Chancellor of Security University, Gujarat State. Presently, no assignment.

21. A.I. Saived (IPS)

He was instrumental in negotiating a support base for Modi among Muslims, misusing position and power and being a native of the powerful accused's Mehsana district of Gujarat. He was promoted to the rank of ADGP and posted to ADGP Administration at the DGP s office. On his retirement he has joined the Bharatiya Janata Party(BJP) and is campaigning for the party at elections. Presently no assignment.

22. P.P. Pande (IPS)

As the incharge of the Ahmedabad City Crime Branch soon after the 2002 carnage he played a vital role in manipulating investigations in favour of the accused in the major carnage cases like the Gulberg case, Naroda Patiya case etc, This fact has been brought out in the affidavit of Shri Rahul Sharma to the Nanavati Shah Mehta Commission. Many of the extra judicial killings ("fake encounters") had taken place during his tenure as chief of Ahmedabad City Crime

Branch. As a reward he was posted as Range In Charge of the cash rich Vadodara range (Vadodara Rural, Godhra, Bharuch and Dahod) Later on he was promoted and posted as ADGP Inteligence, then held post of ADGP Crime (2013). Retired in January 2017, presently no assignment.

22. Ashish Bhatia (IPS)

He headed the Ahmedabad City Crime Branch after the promotion of PP Pande and was also responsible for fake encounters conducted by DIG DG Vanzara. As member of the SIT appointed by the Apex Court he has failed to investigate any documentary evidence and has deliberately ignored charges of destruction of evidence and criminal conspiracy especially when it came to his Gujarat police superiors though he was appointed as part of the SIT on the recommended of the Gujarat state. There are still seriously documented charges against his immediate bosses. Presently DGP, CID (Crime and Railways), Gandhinagar

23. Anil Mukhil (IAS)

In CMO then transferred to Central Govt. **On 24.07.2013** *Indian Express* reported (while Protest Petition being heard) how one of the Protagonists present at the Meeting Anil Mukhim is brought in as Principal Secretary (Revenue) **Annexure "J", Page 3966 of the HC Record**

Subservience of the IPS association

The terror instilled in the minds of the Gujarat bureaucracy is evident in the fact that the IPS association's Gujarat unit did not dare to convene a meeting until about three years after the genocide. A meeting of the IPS association's Gujarat unit was finally convened in August 2005 with an aim to install a pro-government group of officers as office bearers. A campaign was launched to install DG Vanzara as secretary (the main functionary in the association) without holding any elections at all. Fortunately, however, elections were held and DIGP Satish Verma defeated Vanzara by a margin of 13 votes (Verma won 31 votes while Vanzara won 18).

The Gujarat police force had about 8,000 vacancies at the constabulary level and about 950 vacancies at the level of police sub-inspector (PSI). These vacancies are in crucial functional posts right up till 2013. The inadequacy of trained and skilled human resources has had damaging effects on the efficiency, dedication and professionalism of the Gujarat police even as it undermines the quality of service delivered to the people. Overworked and under tremendous stress, the policemen at the constabulary and PSI level take the line of least resistance in matters of policing vis-à-vis the interests of the ruling BJP. Submitting to illegal directives from leaders of the ruling party is the only way they can survive.

As part of a so-called economy measure, the state government has introduced a new cadre of "Lok Rakshaks" under which persons are hired for policing (eventually to replace the constabulary) at a meagre Rs 2,500 per month. A group of senior citizens headed by former DGP, PB Malia, has filed a petition in the Gujarat High Court asking that the scheme be declared illegal.

References from SIT Investigation, Statements, Protest Petition & Criminal Revision Application 205/2014 Malhotra Report

12.10.2010

- i) Nepotism in Postings Transfers Could Not Be proved, Why No action against PC Pande etc was not probed; Page 243
- ii) Nepotism in Promotions, Page 35-36

SIT Closure Report

8.02.2012

i) Policemen who behaved Legally and Constitutionally Punished/ Policemen who Broke the Law and allowed Death and Destruction Rewarded: SIT Conclusion in Further Investigation Reported dated 17.11.2010, **Page 84 -92, Pages 101-102, Volume 1**

Protest Petition Dated 15.4.2013

- i) Page 20(xx) Part 1 Protest petition (REWARDS)
- ii) Nepotism in Rewarding Complicit Public Servants, Para 1035, Page 469, Part II, Protest Petition

CRA 205/2014

- i) Policemen who behaved Legally and Constitutionally Punished/ Policemen who Broke the Law and allowed Death and Destruction ewarded: SIT Conclusion in Further Investigation Reported dated 17.11.2010, **Para 72, Pages A-212-A-213**
- ii) Utter Subversion, Para 98, Page A-254, 57 statements of complicit accused relied upon155, List of Officers Rewarded.